PWG MFD Working Group Face-to-Face Meeting Minutes 1 2 At Lexmark, Lexington, KY 3 October 18, 2010 4 5 1. Attendees: 6 Nancy Chen, Oki Data 7 Frank Martin, Brother 8 Tim McCann, Konica Minolta 9 Ira McDonald*, High North (representing Samsung) 10 Andrew Mitchell, HP Joe Murdock, 11 Sharp Lab America Glen Petrie*, 12 **Epson** 13 Sarma Sista, Konica Minolta 14 Toshiba Amir Shahindoust, 15 Mike Sweet, Apple 16 Jerry Thrasher, Lexmark 17 Bill Wagner, TIC 18 Rick Yardumian, Canon 19 Peter Zehler, Xerox 20 21 *Phone-in attendee 22 23 2. Minutes Taker: Nancy Chen 24 25 3. PWG IP Policy: 26 The working group Chair Peter Zehler announced that this meeting is held in accordance with PWG 27 IP policy. No objection. 28 29 4. Approval of Minutes: 30 The last teleconference meeting minutes: ftp://ftp.pwg.org/pub/pwg/mfd/minutes/pwg-mfdminutes-20100923.pdf was accepted without change. 31 32 33 5. Agenda: 34 Session 1 (9:00-12:00): 35 MFD Overall Detailed Review: Resolve comments, Detailed review and discussion 36 Session 2 (2:45-4:30): 37 **Complete Overall Review** 38 Discuss FaxIn and System Service to resolve any issues preventing their completion 39 40 6. MFD Overall Detailed Review: 41 (document file: ftp://ftp.pwg.org/pub/pwg/mfd/wd/wd-mfdoverallmod10-20101015.pdf) For the benefits of new attendees, Bill gave a little background of the development of this 42 43 specification, Pete gave a brief high-level overview of the MFD Model and Overall Semantics. 44 The MFD Model and Overall Semantics document was started to provide general context on the 45 various MFD services, e.g., the uniform approach to service models, terminologies, etc. It has

now evolved to include everything that is common to more than one service and acted as the

key to the XML Schema of the MFD model. This document has been evolving with the MFD

46

Schema for quite a while. Now since the Schema has been stabilized, it's ready for being finalized. The figure numbers and references to them may not be correct in the document right now due to some Word editing problem, we are focusing on content adequacy and sufficiency of the representation of the schema information in the document today.

48

49

50

51

52

53

54

55

56 57

58

59

60

61

62 63

64

65

66

67

68

69 70

71

72

73

74

75

76

77

78

79

80

81

82

83

84

85

86

87

88

89

90

91

92 93

94

- The MFD Schema is rooted at the object "System", which represents both service and device aspects of the entire MFD (see the latest XML schema files: ftp://ftp.pwg.org/pub/pwg/mfd/schemas/PWG-SM2-Latest1.zip or the Web browse-able schema http://www.pwg.org/mfd/navigate/PwgSmRev1-113 System.html at PWG web site). The device aspect of MFD was traditionally managed by SNMP. The Configuration of the System is a list of all the subunits that are currently defined in the printer MIB, and additional subunits such as scanner, fax modem. The system configuration is also available to each MFD service, providing the service-specific view of the subunits used to complete the service. The Managers and Agents of the devices are from WIMS. System Status - the status of the entire MFD is the roll-up of the statuses of all the MFD services. MFD Services include Print, Scan, FaxIn, FaxOut, EmailIn, EmailOut, Resource, Transform Services, and System Service which is a service for MFD as a whole operating on systems wide resources. Transform Service is for converting electronic document from one format to another, one use is for providing document format transformation from the output of one service to the input format required for its destination. The MFD model does not cover complex jobs or workflow, but has all the components for a higher level language to handle job splitting, job union, management of a sequence of tasks performed by services. All services follow the same structure where each service can have multiple instances and each instance (representing a job queue) has a job pool of a set of defaults and capabilities. This can allow two different job queues with different restrictions (policies) on color printing for example, one can be used to print color document, the other can only print black and white. Recent changes include allowed values for a job ticket or document ticket attributes. The Job Ticket has job and document processing capabilities at the job level which apply to the job and document elements within a job unless overridden by a document instance. Multi-document processing capability is optional. XXXCapabilityReady are those elements that can be applied to a job without needing operator's intervention (e.g. the media that have already been loaded in a tray). ServiceConfiguration is the service-specific view of the subunits used by the service. Service Defaults give you the default tickets of a job and a document. The defaults specify the ticket element values when they are not specified by the submitted job. Service Description is information that can be set administratively, e.g. name and location of the service, controlled by local policy. Service Status are information that cannot be set by end users or administrators, e.g. the service states changed by service operations (pause, resume, etc.). Condition Table in the Service Status is based on the alert table in the MIB, includes active conditions and condition history where an active condition is kept after being removed/resolved. Service Counters in Status is based on all counter definitions in the PWG Counter specification and the Counter MIB. The MFD Model and Overall Semantics document does not include any details on the MFD System object or any service-specific information on each individual MFD Service; the former is covered in the MFD System spec, the latter in an individual MFD Service spec.
- Status of the specifications of the services covered by the MFD Overall document:
 - Print, Scan, and Resource Services are completed as PWG Candidate Standard. Each of them has a specific PWG MFD XML Schema version locked in at the time the specification was completed. The PWG MFD XML Schema has evolved to be more consistent, has basic common structure across the services.
 - o Copy Service is very close to complete.

- o FaxIn Service has just started.
- FaxOut is near complete.
- o EmailIn, EmailOut and Transform are not started.
- Many editorial errors were raised and then fixed on-the-fly by the editors during the meeting.
 They are not recorded in this minutes. Recorded herein are only global changes that need to be carefully searched and fixed throughout the document after the meeting, and some important conceptual or technical re-alignments agreed or to be discussed further in future meetings.
 - Agreed that the textual descriptive name for the current MFD XML Schema with reference to [MFD_SCHEMA] should be consistent throughout the document as "the PWG MFD XML Schema". The last sentence of the first paragraph of Section 1.1 should read: "This document is technically aligned with the named version of the PWG MFD XML Schema [MFD_SCHEMA]."
 - o Globally make sure that all "e.g." and "i.e." has a period following each character.
 - o Make it clear that in an XML Schema diagram, an element enclosed within a solid box represents a mandatory element; whereas the one enclosed within a dash-lined box represents an optional element. This applies to an "Any" element which represents an optional extension element. However, an "Any" within a pentagon represents an attribute extension which is optional by definition and is always bounded by solid lines.
 - Add a discussion about the distinctions between System Service Description/Status and System Description/Status before the description of MFD services. System does not have Capabilities because System does not have jobs, therefore does not have job or document ticket. System Service operates on System object, has its Service Description and Service Status that are distinct from the System Description and System Status.
 - Section 2.1.2 Functional Overview of a MFD
 - Paragraph 3 and 8 are duplicates, also paragraph 6 and 10 are duplicates.
 Remove the copy that is redundant.
 - Figure 4 Relationships within a MFD diagram needs a higher resolution update; also add recent changes to Service Defaults and Service Capabilities.
 - Globally make sure that all words in a multi-words title case term are separated with a space.
 - Section 2.2 Jobs, Documents, Tickets, and Templates
 - Paragraph 4, first sentence should read: "Support of multi-document jobs is optional."
 - The first sentence of the last two paragraphs: remove "as a job / document within a job is processed". A Job / Document Receipt is created as soon as a job is created so that job accounting may take a look at the values in the receipt. The "values" in the second sentence of both paragraphs should be "actual values".
 - Section 2.3.1 Content Regions
 - The end of Paragraph 3 at the top of page 25. The reference for Content Region is from Print Service which should be PWG 5100.3 (IPP Production Printing), section 2.2 Finished Page Image Cell.
 - Add a discussion text that references Figure 6 Hardcopy Document, Region, Image Relationship.
 - Section 2.3.2 Job/Document Object and Digital Document Cardinality
 - Second sentence: only Scan and Transform Services accept multi-document jobs. Change (e.g., Print and Scan) to (e.g., Scan and Transform).

143		 For MDSF, clarify that "Each document object contains one file URI for the
144		image file location. "
145		 For MDMF, the last two sentences, clarify that "Each Document object contains
146		a file URI for each image file location." And "Each Destination is the directory
147		URI for the Document."
148	0	Section 2.4.2.3 Document Format Coordinates
149		 The discussion of "XXX Box" mentioned in the text and figures in this section
150		(Section 2.4) is taken offline for input from Mike Sweet and some experts from
151		Adobe to align with the PDF and PS terminologies. In IPP, "region" is used
152		instead of "Box". Is Content Box the same as "Image Box".
153	0	Section 2.5 Job and Ticket Lifecycle
154		 Figure 11 needs image resolution upgrade, be larger. Correct the arrow
155		direction to pointing from the text "May be obtained from locations outside the
156		scope of the specification (e.g. Resource Service)" to the "Job Template" box.
157	0	Globally remove any text that reference FaxIn Service or specification, because we only
158		have an interim draft for the service.
159	0	Globally change all the bolded text in the body of all sections in the document to plain
160		text.
161	0	Globally left justify the description text in the cells of all tables in the document.
162	0	Section 2.6 Datatypes
163		 Ira will provide the reference to the DMTF CIM printer class to Bill.
164	0	Section 3 System Configuration - Subunits
165		 Table 4: Add RFC reference for FaxModem. Move [RFC3805] down to each of
166		the subunits that uses a Printer MIB object as the source.
167		 First sentence after Table 4: change "Certain Status elements" to "Many Status
168		elements".
169		 Remove text on description of "Any" element in the paragraph after Table 4. It
170		is already described in a previous section.
171	0	Section 3.1.1.1 Power Counters
172		 All Power Counters in subunits are life time counters; there is no persistence
173		attribute in the current MFD XML Schema here. Update the description text and
174		Figure 14 Power Counter Schema.
175	0	Section 3.1.1 Common Subunit Description Elements
176		 Include the XML Schema diagram for all Power elements
177	0	Global change: an Element description Table should always follow the XML Schema
178		diagram for which the Table describes.
179	0	Section 3.3 Covers:
180		 Cover should not have any power management elements: should not allow
181		scheduling of power behavior for cover interlock, should not allow hibernation
182		of a power interlock. Power for cover interlock cannot be suppressed – violates
183		safety regulatory compliance. Pete to remove all Power elements from Cover
184		Description Schema. Bill to add Cover Description in Table 16 Cover Elements
185	0	Section 3.4 FaxModems:
186		 Reference should be RFC 1696 (Modem MIB) not RFC3066 (Language Tags) in
187		both Description and Status Element Tables.

188

Section 3.5 Finisher:

189		 Table 19 Finisher Subunit Elements – FinisherType reference description should
190		read: "FinDeviceTypeTC is originally defined in [RFC3806] and updated in [IANA-
191		FIN]" Ira to send the references [IANA-FIN] and [IANA-PRT] to Pete or Bill.
192	0	Global comment: change "compatible with" to "technically aligned with" to mean that
193		the elements and semantics are preserved.
194	0	Section 3.12 Output Channels
195		 Input and Output Channels are software stacks, Interpreter is also a software,
196		they cannot be power managed.
197		 Pete to remove all Power Management elements from the Schema. Add
198		notes to the common introduction section to subunits.
199		 Ira to add similar notes in Power Model spec.
200	0	Section 3.16 Scanners:
201		 Table of Scanner Subunit elements: Change ScannerCounterLife and
202		ScannerCounterPowerOn elements to ScannerLifeCount and
203		ScannerPowerOnCount to align with prtMarkerLifeCount and
204		prtMarkerPowerOnCount in Printer MIB.
205	0	Section 3.17 Storages:
206		 Remove the enumeration of Storage Type keywords and only provide some
207		examples, or list them in the Table of Storage Elements in StorageType keyword
208		description column.
209		 Remove the Reference Column of the Vendor Subunit Elements.
210	0	Section 4 Service Model Component Elements
211		 Change the title to "Service Model Element Groups".
212	0	Section 4.4 Service Capabilities and Service Capabilities Ready
213		 This section has added Job Ticket Capabilities and Document Ticket Capabilities
214		in Service Capabilities and Service Capabilities Ready.
215		 This section currently is missing subsections that describe Document Description
216		Capabilities and Document Processing Capabilities of Document Ticket
217		Capabilities.
218		 The capability support for the recently added properties of Document
219		(Compression, DocumentFormat, DocumentFormatDetails,
220		DocumentFormatVersion) need to be added. These elements are represented in
221		a Service's ServiceDescription (as XXX). They are represented in a Services's
222		capabilities (in the Job and Document Description element of the tickets) as
223		XXXSupplied. They are represented in a Services's defaults (in the Job and
224		Document Description element of the tickets) also as as XXXSupplied. The
225		agreed upon policy is if an Administrator changes one of the values, all the
226		associated values are changes as well. Effectively there is a single data item
227		with multiple symbolic links. It was also noted that the Job's Status element has
228		a related set of elements (i.e. XXXDetected) that is used to record the actual
229		value used by the service.
230	0	Section 4.4.1 Document Processing Capabilities
231	-	 Missing representation of Document output color – Currently ColorEntry
232		represent the colors for Scan, not for document output color.
233		OutputDocumentColor is for the generation of digital document, not for
234		outputting a hardcopy document. The name of the element and the list of color
235		keywords for user to choose for hardcopy document output color is deferred to
236		IPP Everywhere group discussion for the final decision.
		s. ,

238	Document	Processing Capabilities, and the named version of the MFD
239	Schema fo	r this spec so that the MFD Overall Document does not
240	depend or	the future version of IPP spec. The latest spec of the Overall
241	document	will be reflected in IPP Everywhere spec.
242	 MediaCol should h 	ave its own section that contains detailed description of the
243	object and the des	cription of this element in the Table of Document Processing
244	Capabilities should	I state that "See Section xxx for MediaCols." In the section for
245	MediaCols should	specify the special rules that govern MediaCols. The most
246	import rule is whe	n you get Printer Capabilities, MediaCols (may be a large
247	database) should ા	not be returned by design. An explicit call to get MediaCols is
248	required for this p	•
249		solete and replaced by other attributes. Remove.
250		Size is currently defined in Transform Service for scaling
251	_ ,,	cable to Scan Service.
252	 Section 4.4.2 Job Descripti 	·
253		ce-specific attributes in the Table of Job and Resource
254	·	ilities. Remove "and Resource" from the title of the table.
255	• •	or Compression, DocumentFormat, DocumentFormatDetails,
256		/ersion in the XML Schema diagram and the elements table.
257	 Section 4.4.3 Job Processing 	- ,
258	•	Interval and RetryTimeout should be of type "range of
259	integers".	
260		ol description text and Schema diagram as a section to the
261		ore its first reference.
262		and upperbound entries from Capabilities tables. They are
263	represented by range of in	-
264		keAndModel is a Boolean in Capabilities, a string in Ticket.
265	 Section 4.5 Service Description 	
266		vice Description Elements
267		tableElementsSupported is a list of keywords.
268		ServiceGeoLocation entry that has empty description.
269		tication and XriSecurity are both of keyword type.
270	•	led properties of Document (Compression, DocumentFormat,
271		Details, DocumentFormatVersion) in the XML Schema diagram
272	and the elements	
273	o Section 4.6.1 Condition Ta	
274		line: "Alerter Tabble {" should be "Alert Table [".
275	Second paragraph	
276		nce, separate the concatenated two words in
277	"elements	
278		d text: "otional" should be "optional".
279		n "Any" after the first description.
700	 Section 5 Imaging Job Mod 	lel
280 281	Paragraph 3,	

• Pete/Bill to remove ColorEntry and Colorrant from the Table of

282		 Delete the first sentence, remove the () of the second sentence, and
283		reword the sentence, e.g. "Some services do not expose the Document
284		object".
285		 Line 2, change "some Services are considered not to include
286		Documents" to "some Services do not support Documents".
287		 Line 5, remove 's' from "Document Processing elements".
288	0	Section 5.1 Job Status
289		Add '.' At the end of first paragraph.
290		In Table, add datatype "string" for JobUuid element. Add datatype "anyURI" for
291		JobOriginatingUri.
292	0	Globally for all UUIDs: Add description text "An urn::uuid unique URI value". Add
293		reference RFC4122 for UUID.
294	0	Global: For all the description of the DocumentAccessError element in tables, remove
295		the second sentence entirely.
296	0	Global: Fix all unmatched open/close parentheses.
297	0	Global: Bulleted items should capitalize the first letter of the first word.
298	0	Global: Defined terms should be in titlecase.
299	0	Section 5.2.2 Document Processing
300		In the table of elements, add "complex" type for "CoverBack" element. Add
301		datatype 'complex' for OutputDocumentSize
302		 Remove the table of Media Collection Elements in Job Ticket – the table and
303		description text of these already exist in its own section previous. Here, only
304		reference the MediaCol section in Capabilities.
305	0	Sec 5.2.3Job Processing
306		Remove Sec 5.2.3.1 & 5.2.3.2 which are described in the reference [JPS2].
307	0	Global (& Table 50): The reference to "IPP production set 2" should be "IPP JPS2" and
308		should use its official Candidate Standard document name when the spec is approved.
309		The referenced document "[prod-print2]" should be "[JPS2]".
310	0	Global: "JobJobDelayOutputUntil" & "JobJobDelayOutputUntilTime" should be
311		"JobDelayOutputUntil" & "JobDelayOutputUntilTime" respectively.
312	0	Section 6 Document Model
313		 First paragraph, the sentences in () – "During Job creation, it is possible that
314		temporarily there are zero documents" should be consistent with the changes
315		made in the Job Model section.
316	0	Section 6.2 Document Status
317		The description of the element DetailedStatusMessages in the element table:
318		remove all the elaborations after the first sentence.
319	0	Global: remove all the elaborations of the description text for an element that is taken
320		from the referenced document, especially those conformance/restriction statements in
321		the referenced spec.
322	0	Section 7.1.2 Job Creation
323		 Remove the text that was already described in section 2.5. Job and Job Ticket
324		Lifecycle.
325	0	Section 7.1.4
326		 Change the title to: "Service Pause, Service Shutdown, and Job Abnormal
327		Termination"
328	0	Section 7.2.1.2 Operations, Events, and Conditions

329		 Update to better resolution for the figure on Service State Transitions and
330		Causal Events.
331	0	Sec 7.2.1.3
332		 Add Notes for Table 54 State Change by Operations
333	0	Sec 7.2.2 Job States and Job Transitions
334		 Remove all conformance statements from the definition of the job states.
335		Job States should refer to RFC2911. Do the same for Document State.
336		Change ScanJob => Job in fig 76.
337	0	Sec 7.3 Service Operation
338		 Remove conformance statements on paragraph 2 & 3.
339	0	Sec 7.3.1 Basic Service Operations
340		Fix the font size for subsection heading 7.3.1.1 & 7.3.1.2
341		 Put an introduction states that this section specifies the normative behavior and
342		semantics of all services that are adopted in MFD model to keep the basic
343		operations consistent.
344		• Sec 7.3.1.2 - The last sentence of the first paragraph: change "before the it is
345		actually terminated" to "before the document is cancelled".
346		Sec 7.3.1.6 – Remove "Operation" from the title. Clabel Add as a subscript for the association in a subscript in the su
347	0	Global: Add an explanation for the exception in service operation definitions: spaces are
348		not inserted among title-case-words of a service operation name to preserve clarity.
349 350	0	Sec 7.3.1.11 – Change the operation name to Get <service>Job. Sec 7.3.1.15</service>
350 351	0	
351 252		 Remove Table 60 & 61, and reference RFC2911 in place of the tables.
352 252	0	Sec 7.3.1.19 The "LIPI" for eneration or element should be title case "Livi" but in the toyt
353 254		 The "URI" for operation or element should be title case "Uri", but in the text description they should be "URI".
354 355		 Pete: ensure MFD XML Schema will use Title case for operation and elements,
356		and for future PWG Semantic Model version 2. Currently SendPrintUri and
357		PrintURI in Print Service of MFD XML Schema are inconsistent. WS-Print/WS-
358		Scan use Title case.
359	0	Section 7.3.1.21 Set <service>JobElements</service>
360	O	The necessity of Hold & Release Job operations were discussed; they are to be
361		deprecated in the future IPP specification. Agreed to add notes in these two
362		operations in Sec 7.3.1.14 & 7.3.1.15 that state in the second paragraph that
363		performing a Set <service>JobElements operation by setting the "HoldJobUntil"</service>
364		or "HoldJobUntilTime" attributes is semantically equivalent to these two
365		operations.
366		 The last paragraph needs to be re-written.
367	0	Global: Remove state tables (tables 64 & 65) wherever possible, and replace them with
368		a reference to the proper table in RFC2911.
369	0	Section 7.3.2.12 Shutdown <service>Service</service>
370		 Should we Include job state reasons, service state reasons with mention of
371		extensibility: We agreed that in the section of Service State, there should
372		description of service state and service state reasons and how they related to
373		each other, and how they should be extended. Do not provide the list of all of
374		them, simply point to the IANA registry for all of them. The relationship
375		between service state and service state reasons should be described in section

376 377	4.6.1 – Condition Table. State reasons augment the information available about the state of services or jobs.
378	 Pete to provide the verbiage for this.
379	7. Next Steps
380	 Pete and Bill to post the updated version of the MFD Overall document from today's review.
381	 Pete to Update the MFD XML Schema and the Schema diagram in the Overall.
382	 Pete to republish the named XML Schema for the Overall spec.
383	 Everyone: please continue to review the remaining sections not discussed today and provide
384	comments through email list.
385	 All to review the updated Overall document in the next MFD teleconference.
386	 Next teleconference is in two weeks on November 4, 2010, Thursday, 3pm EDT.